Supplementary material 1: Search documentation

#	Query	Limiters/Expanders	Last Run Via	Results
S5	S1 AND S2	Limiters - Peer Reviewed; Date Published: 19700101- 20171231 Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - ERIC	812
S4	S1 AND S2	Limiters - Date Published: 19700101-20171231 Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - ERIC	1,850
S3	S1 AND S2	Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - ERIC	1,877
S2	TI ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR SU ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR	Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen -	616,696

Search documentation – Education Resources Information Centre (ERIC) – 31.1.2018

	school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR KW ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR AB ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "High school equivalency program*" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR AB ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR		Advanced Search Database - ERIC	
S1		Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - ERIC	4,817

Search documentation – Education Source – 31.1.18

#	Query	Limiters/Expanders	Last Run Via	Results
S5	S1 AND S2	Limiters - Scholarly (Peer Reviewed) Journals; Published Date: 19710101-20181231 Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - Education Source	614
S4	S1 AND S2	Limiters - Published Date: 19700101-20181231 Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - Education Source	880
S3	S1 AND S2	Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - Education Source	885
S2	TI ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR AB ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*))	Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search	400,115

	OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K- 12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR SU ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR KW ((((elementary OR "elementary secondary" OR primary OR secondary) N2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior high" OR middle) N2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 12")) OR KW ((((state 1" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12")) OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade 5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade 11" OR "Grade 12"))		Database - Education Source	
S1	TI (((((Deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "deep level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st century") N2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) OR AB (((((Deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "deep level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st century") N2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) OR SU (((((Deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "deep level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st century") N2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) OR KW (((((Deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) N2 (learning)) OR "deep level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st century") N2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) OR KW (((((10 eep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR "in-de	Search modes - Boolean/Phrase	Interface - EBSCOhost Research Databases Search Screen - Advanced Search Database - Education Source	5,995

Search documentation – Scopus – 31.1.18

5	(TITLE ADS VEV (((door* OD "in douth" OD "in douth" OD transfor) W/2 (looming)) OD "door	
5	(TITLE-ABS-KEY(((((deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) W/2 (learning)) OR "deep	415
	level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st	document
	century") W/2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) AND (TITLE-ABS-	results
	KEY ((elementary OR "elementary	
	secondary" OR primary OR secondary) W/2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior	
	high" OR middle) W/2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate	
	grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade	
	5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade	
	11" OR "Grade 12")) AND (LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2018) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2017) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2016) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2015) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2014) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2013) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2012) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2011) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2010) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2009) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2008) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2007) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2006) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2005) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2004) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2003) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2002) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2001) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2000) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1999) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1998) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1997) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1996) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1995) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1994) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1988) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1985) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1983) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1978) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1976)) AND (LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "ar") OR LIMIT-	
	TO (DOCTYPE, "re") OR LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "ip"))	
4	(TITLE-ABS-KEY((((deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) W/2 (learning)) OR "deep	656 document
	level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st	results
	century") W/2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) AND (TITLE-ABS-	
	KEY ((elementary OR "elementary	
	secondary" OR primary OR secondary) W/2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior	
	high" OR middle) W/2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate	
	grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade	
	5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade	
	on onder on onder on onder on onder on on onder on on onder	

	11" OD "C. I. 12")) AND (INST TO (DUDYEAD 2010) OD INST	
	11" OR "Grade 12")) AND (LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2018) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2017) OR LIMIT TO (PUBYEAR, 2016) OR LIMIT	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2017) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2016) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2015) OR LIMIT TO (PUBYEAR, 2014) OR LIMIT	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2015) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2014) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2013) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2012) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2013) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2012) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2011) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2010) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2011) OK LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2010) OK LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2009) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2008) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2009) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2008) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2007) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2006) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2007) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2006) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2005) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2004) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2003) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2002) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 2001) OR LIMIT TO (PUBYEAR, 2000) OR LIMIT	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 2001) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 2000) OR LIMIT-	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1999) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1998) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 1997) OR LIMIT TO (PUBYEAR, 1996) OR LIMIT	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1997) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1996) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 1995) OR LIMIT TO (PUBYEAR, 1994) OR LIMIT	
	TO (PUBYEAR, 1995) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1994) OR LIMIT- TO (PUBYEAR, 1988) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1985) OR LIMIT-	
3	TO (PUBYEAR, 1983) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1978) OR LIMIT-TO (PUBYEAR, 1976))	663 document
3	(TITLE-ABS-KEY ((((deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) W/2 (learning)) OR "deep level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st	results
	century") W/2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))) AND (TITLE-ABS-	lesuits
	KEY ((clementary OR "clementary	
	secondary" OR primary OR secondary) W/2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior	
	high" OR middle) W/2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate	
	grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade	
	5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade	
	11" OR "Grade 12"))	
2	TITLE-ABS-KEY (((elementary OR "elementary	316,312
2	secondary" OR primary OR secondary) W/2 (education* OR school*)) OR ((high OR "junior	document
	high" OR middle) W/2 (school*)) OR "high school equivalency program*" OR "intermediate	results
	grade*" OR "K12" OR "K-12" OR "Grade 1" OR "Grade 2" OR "Grade 3" OR "Grade 4" OR "Grade	ICSUIIS
	5" OR "Grade 6" OR "Grade 7" OR "Grade 8" OR "Grade 9" OR "Grade 10" OR "Grade	
	11" OR "Grade 12")	
1	TITLE-ABS-KEY ((((deep* OR "in depth" OR "in-depth" OR transfer) W/2 (learning)) OR "deep	22,865
1	level processing" OR "adaptive expertise") OR (("21st	document
	century") W/2 (skills OR learning OR knowledge OR competencies)))	results
	century j w/2 (skins ok leanning ok knowledge ok competencies j j)	1050115

Supplementary material 2: Overview included studies

								Key eleme	ents in definition
No	Author	Key term	School Subject	Sample age range	Country	Meaning	Relating	Intrinsic motivation	Other
1	Aharony (2006)	Deep Learning Approach	Languages	12-18	Israel	х	х		Metacognitive strategies
2	Alkharusi (2013)	Deep Learning Strategies	Languages	15-17	Oman		х		Critical thinking
3	Baas et al. (2015)	Deep-level learning strategies	Not reported	9-12	The Netherlands	х			Application of knowledge
4	Beausaert et al. (2013)	Deep-approach to learning	Languages and Math	12-18	The Netherlands	х	х	х	
5	Blom and Severiens (2008)	Deep Learning	Languages and Math	15-16	The Netherlands	х			Critical thinking
6	Burnett and Proctor (2002)	Deep approach to learning	Languages and Math	10-12	Australia	х	х		Transformation
7	Burnett et al. (2003)	Deep learning	Not reported	12-20	Australia	х			
8	Campbell et al. (2001)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	11-16	Australia	х	х		
9	Cano (2007)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	16-17	Spain	х	х	х	
10	Cano and Cardelle-Elawar (2004)	Deep learning conception	Not reported	11-16	Spain	х			
11	Chan (2008)	Deep learning approaches	Science	12-17	Hong Kong	x			
12	Chan and Chan (2011)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	12-17	Hong Kong	x	х	х	
13	Cheung (2014)	Deep learning strategies	Science	16-18	Hong Kong	x	~		Metacognitive strategies, Critical thinking
14	Cheung and Lai (2013)	Deep learning strategies	Not reported	16-17	Hong Kong	x			Metacognitive strategies, Critical thinking
15	Chin and Brown (2000)	Deep approach	Science	13-14	USA	x	х	x	Metaeogintive strategies, ernicar tiniking
16	Chiou and Liang (2012)	Deep approach to learning	Science	16-17	Taiwan	X	X	x	
17	Chiou et al. (2013)	Deep approach to learning	Science	15-18	Taiwan	x	X	x	
18	Chou (2017)	Deep processing strategies	Languages	17-18	Taiwan	x	л	л	Metacognitive strategies
-	Chou (2017) Chu et al. (2010)								Metacognitive strategies
19 20	Colak and Cirik (2016)	Deep approach to learning	Computer Science Not reported	8-12 14-15	Hong Kong Turkey	x	х	x	I and tame actuation
		Deep learning				х			Long-term retention
21	Dahlin and Watkins (2000)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	15-18	Hong Kong	x			
22	Dan and Todd (2014)	Deep-learning strategies	Social Science	12-13	China	х	x	x	The second se
23	Dart et al. (2000)	Deep learning approach	Math, Science, Social Science, Languages, Art	11-16	Australia	x			Transformation
24	Dart et al. (1999)	Deep approach to learning	Math, Science, Languages, Art	11-16	Australia	х			Transformation
25	Elstad et al. (2012)	Deep learning approach	Science	16-18	Norway	х	х		
26	García et al. (2015)	Deep learning approach	Math	10-13	Spain		х		
27	Goto et al. (2018)	Deep learning approach	Science	8-15	Japan	х			
28	Göçmençelebi et al. (2012)	Deep learning	Science	10-13	Turkey	х	x		Long-term retention, Application of knowledge
29	Hii and Fong (2010)	Deep approach to learning	Social Science	13-14	Malaysia	х	х	х	
30	Ho and Liang (2015)	Deep motive in learning	Science	15-18	Taiwan	х		х	
31	Janeiro et al. (2017)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	15-21	Portugal	x		x	
32	Kirby and Woodhouse (1994)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	Not reported	Canada/Not reported	x		x	
33	Kong and Hau (1996)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	13-14	Hong Kong	x		x	
34	Koopman et al. (2014)	Deep cognitive learning strategies	Not reported	12-18	The Netherlands	~	x	A	Critical thinking
35	Lai and Biggs (1994)	Deep approach to learning	Science	12-14	Hong Kong	x	~		Critical annual
36	Lau et al. (2008)	Deep learning strategies	Math	12-14	Singapore	x	х		
37	Lee et al. (2008)	Deep approaches to learning	Science	15-18	Taiwan	x	X	x	
38	Liet al. (2008)	Deep approach to learning	Science	13-16	China	x	л	л	
39	Lien et al. (2018)			13-16	Australia				
39 40	Liem et al. (2012) Lingvay et al. (2015)	Deep learning Deep approach to learning	Not reported Science	13-14	Hungary and Romania	X			
						х			
41	Luby (2014)	Deep approach to learning	Religion	13-16	Scotland	-	X		Materia di Antonio Coltical di Li
42	Matos et al. (2017)	Deep-level learning strategies	Math	14-15	Peru		X		Metacognitive strategies, Critical thinking
43	Mazlum et al. (2015)	Deep learning approaches	Languages	16-17	Iran	x	х		
44	McClintic-Gilbert et al. (2013)	Deep learning strategies	Math, Science, Languages, Social science	11-14	USA		х		Metacognitive strategies, Critical thinking
45	McInerney et al. (2012)	Deep learning strategies	Languages, Math	12-14	Hong Kong	х	х	х	
46	Munowenyu (2007)	Deep level learning	Science	13-14	Zimbabwe	х			
47	Murayama et al. (2013)	Deep learning strategies	Math	10-16	Germany		х		
48	Norris et al. (2015)	Deep approach to learning	Social science	13-14	England		х	х	
49	Phan and Ngu (2015)	Deep approach to learning	Languages	15-16	Fiji	x	x	х	
50	Rao et al. (2007)	Deep approach to learning	Languages	11-12	Singapore	х	х		
51	Rozendaal et al. (2001)	Deep-level processing	Vocational	12-18	The Netherlands		х	х	Metacognitive strategies, Critical thinking

52	Şen (2016)	Deep cognitive learning strategies	Not reported	16-17	Turkey		x		Critical thinking, Long-term retention, Application of knowledge
53	Smith and Colby (2007)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	Not reported	USA	х			
54	van Aalst et al. (2007)	Deep learning	Computer Science	16-19	Hong Kong	х	х	х	
55	Vos et al. (2011)	Deep learning	Languages	10-12	The Netherlands	х	х		Critical thinking, Long-term retention, Application of knowledge
56	Watkins and Ismail (1994)	Deep approach	Not reported	14-15	Malaysia/Hong Kong/Australia	х	х	х	
57	Watkins et al. (2003)	Deep learning approach	Not reported	14-15	South Africa	х	х	х	
58	Wishart and Triggs (2010)	Deep learning	Science, Computer Science	11-23	Germany, Lithuania, Portugal, Austria, UK	х	х		
59	Yerdelen-Damar and Elby (2016)	Deep level processing	Science	15-17	Turkey	х			
60	Yerdelen-Damar and Aydin (2015)	Deep level processing	Science	14-20	Turkey	х			Application of knowledge
61	Zhang and Ziegler (2016)	Deep-learning approach	Languages and Math	12-16	China	х			
62	Zheng et al. (2017)	Deep learning approach	Science	10-12	China	х	х	х	
63	Önen (2015)	Deep approach to learning	Not reported	14-17	Turkey	х	х	х	Application of knowledge

No	Author	Key term	Subject	Sample age range	Origin	Key elements in definition
64	Grover et al. (2015)	Deeper learning	Computer Science	11-14	USA	Transfer, Cognitive skills, Interpersonal skills, Intrapersonal skills
65	Nehring and Szczesiul (2015)	Deeper learning	Not reported	12-18	Northern Ireland	Transfer, Cognitive skills, Interpersonal skills, Intrapersonal skills
66	Parker et al. (2013)	Deeper learning	Social science	13-18	USA	Adaptive transfer, differentiated, elaborated, integrated and flexible
67	Parker et al. (2017)	Deeper learning/Deep learning	Social science	13-18	USA	Adaptive transfer, differentiated, elaborated, integrated and flexible
68	Parker et al. (2011)	Deeper learning/Deep learning	Social science	13-18	USA	Adaptive transfer, differentiated, elaborated, integrated and flexible

	Author	Key term	Subject	Sample age range	Origin	Connection to deep learning
69	Grotzer et al. (2015)	Transfer of learning	Science	10-12	USA	Deep initial learning is a requisite for transfer of learning
70	Pugh et al. (2014)	Transfer of learning	Science	14-16	USA	Deep learning, is a requisite for transfer of learning
71	Schiff and Vakil (2014)	Transfer of learning	Math	8-12	Israel	Deep initial learning is a requisite for transfer of learning

References

- Aharony, N. (2006). The use of deep and surface learning strategies among students learning English as a foreign language in an Internet environment. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, *76*(4), 851-866. <u>https://doi.org/10.1348/000709905X79158</u>
- Alkharusi, H. (2013). Canonical correlational models of students' perceptions of assessment tasks, motivational orientations, and learning strategies. *International Journal of Instruction*, 6(1), 21-38. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1085374</u>
- Baas, D., Castelijns, J., Vermeulen, M., Martens, R., & Segers, M. (2015). The relation between Assessment for Learning and elementary students' cognitive and metacognitive strategy use. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 85(1), 33-46. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/bjep.12058</u>
- Beausaert, S. A. J., Segers, M. S. R., & Wiltink, D. P. A. (2013). The influence of teachers' teaching approaches on students' learning approaches: The student perspective. *Educational Research*, 55(1), 1-15. https://doi.org/10.1080/00131881.2013.767022
- Blom, S., & Severiens, S. (2008). Engagement in self-segulated deep learning of successful immigrant and non-immigrant students in inner city schools. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 23(1), 41-58. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03173139</u>
- Burnett, P. C., Pillay, H., & Dart, B. C. (2003). The influences of conceptions of learning and learner self-concept on high school students' approaches to learning. *School Psychology International*, 24(1), 54-66. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0143034303024001621</u>
- Burnett, P. C., & Proctor, R. M. (2002). Elementary school students' learner self-concept, academic self-concepts and approaches to learning. *Educational Psychology in Practice*, 18(4), 325-333. https://doi.org/10.1080/0266736022000022020
- Campbell, J., Smith, D., Boulton-Lewis, G., Brownlee, J., Burnett, P. C., Carrington, S., & Purdie, N. (2001). Students' Perceptions of Teaching and Learning: the influence of students' approaches to learning and teachers' approaches to teaching. *Teachers & Teaching*, 7(2), 173-187. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600120054964</u>
- Cano, F. (2007). Approaches to learning and study orchestrations in high school students. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 22(2), 131-151. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03173518
- Cano, F., & Cardelle-Elawar, M. (2004). An integrated analysis of secondary school students' conceptions and beliefs about learning. *European Journal of Psychology of Education, 19*(2), 167-187. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03173230</u>
- Chan, C. K. K. (2008). Pedagogical transformation and knowledge-building for the Chinese Learner. *Evaluation and Research in Education*, 21(3), 235-251. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09500790802485245
- Chan, C. K. K., & Chan, Y. Y. (2011). Students' views of collaboration and online participation in Knowledge Forum. *Computers and Education*, 57(1), 1445-1457. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2010.09.003
- Cheung, D. (2014). The combined effects of classroom teaching and learning strategy use on students' chemistry self-efficacy. *Research in Science Education*, 45(1), 101-116. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11165-014-9415-0
- Cheung, D., & Lai, E. (2013). The effects of classroom teaching on students' self-efficacy for personal development. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 41(2), 164-177. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2012.721126</u>
- Chin, C., & Brown, D. E. (2000). Learning in science: A comparison of deep and surface approaches. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 37(2), 109-138. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1098-2736(20002)37:2%3C109::AID-TEA3%3E3.0.CO;2-7
- Chiou, G. L., Lee, M. H., & Tsai, C. C. (2013). High school students' approaches to learning physics with relationship to epistemic views on physics and conceptions of learning physics. *Research in Science and Technological Education*, 31(1), 1-15. https://doi.org/10.1080/02635143.2013.794134
- Chiou, G. L., & Liang, J. C. (2012). Exploring the structure of science self-efficacy: A model built on high school students' conceptions of learning and approaches to learning in science. *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 21(1), 83-91. <u>https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-</u>84858776382&partnerID=40&md5=f9cced939df761a4f0f85f3847975792
- Chou, M. H. (2017). Modelling the relationship among prior english level, self-efficacy, critical thinking, and strategies in reading performance. *Journal of Asia TEFL*, *14*(3), 380-397. <u>https://doi.org/10.18823/asiatefl.2017.14.3.1.380</u>

- Chu, S. K. W., Mak, M. Y. K., & Tsang, K. (2010). An electronic news database for upper primary school students and teachers in Hong Kong. *School Library Media Research*, 13. <u>https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-78751513503&partnerID=40&md5=067a1b0ddf8ce4447a37cf3b686c75b9</u>
- Çolak, E., & Cirik, İ. (2016). Learning approaches profile of high school students *Mersin University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, *12*(1), 106-118. <u>https://doi.org/10.17860/efd.87832</u>
- Dahlin, B., & Watkins, D. (2000). The role of repetition in the processes of memorising and understanding: a comparison of the views of German and Chinese secondary school students in Hong Kong. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 70(1), 65-84. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1348/000709900157976</u>
- Dan, Y., & Todd, R. (2014). Examining the mediating effect of learning strategies on the relationship between students' history interest and achievement. *Educational Psychology*, *34*(7), 799-817. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/01443410.2013.792331</u>
- Dart, B. C., Burnett, P. C., Boulton-Lewis, G., Campbell, J., Smith, D., & McCrindle, A. (1999). Classroom learning environments and students' approaches to learning. *Learning Environments Research*, 2(2), 137-156. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1009966107233</u>
- Dart, B. C., Burnett, P. C., Purdie, N., Boulton-Lewis, G., Campbell, J., & Smith, D. (2000). Students' conceptions of learning, the classroom environment, and approaches to learning. *Journal of Educational Research*, 93(4), 262-270. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/00220670009598715</u>
- Elstad, E., Christophersen, K. A., & Turmo, A. (2012). The influence of parents and teachers on the deep learning approach of pupils in Norwegian upper-secondary schools. *Electronic Journal of Research in Educational Psychology*, 10(1), 35-56. <u>https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-</u> <u>84866773138&partnerID=40&md5=56b7376a04d5d2634301cdf4f5a30732</u>
- García, T., Cueli, M., Rodríguez, C., Krawec, J., & González-Castro, P. (2015). Metacognitive knowledge and skills in students with deep approach to learning. Evidence from mathematical problem solving [Article]. *Revista de Psicodidactica*, 20(2), 209-226. <u>https://doi.org/10.1387/RevPsicodidact.13060</u>
- Goto, T., Nakanishi, K., & Kano, K. (2018). A large-scale longitudinal survey of participation in scientific events with a focus on students' learning motivation for science: Antecedents and consequences. *Learning and Individual Differences*, *61*, 181-187. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2017.12.005</u>
- Grotzer, T. A., Powell, M. M., Derbiszewska, K. M., Courter, C. J., Kamarainen, A. M., Metcalf, S. J., & Dede, C. J. (2015). Turning transfer inside out: The affordances of virtual worlds and mobile devices in real world contexts for teaching about causality across time and distance in ecosystems. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning,* 20(1), 43-69. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10758-014-9241-5
- Grover, S., Pea, R., & Cooper, S. (2015). Designing for deeper learning in a blended computer science course for middle school students. *Computer Science Education*, 25(2), 199-237. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/08993408.2015.1033142</u>
- Göçmençelebi, Ş. İ., Özkan, M., & Bayram, N. (2012). Evaluating primary school students' deep learning approach to science lessons. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 4(3), 554-562. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED583072</u>
- Hii, S. C., & Fong, S. F. (2010). Effects of multimedia redundancy in history learning among 'Deep and Surface' students. *Asian Social Science*, 6(6), 119-127. http://ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ass/article/view/6244
- Ho, H.-N. J., & Liang, J.-C. (2015). The relationships among scientific epistemic beliefs, conceptions of learning science, and motivation of earning science: A study of Taiwan high school students. *International Journal of Science Education*, 37(16), 2688-2707. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/09500693.2015.1100346</u>
- Janeiro, I. N., Duarte, A. M., Araújo, A. M., & Gomes, A. I. (2017). Time perspective, approaches to learning, and academic achievement in secondary students. *Learning & Individual Differences, 55*, 61-68. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2017.03.007</u>
- Kirby, J. R., & Woodhouse, R. A. (1994). Measuring and predicting depth of processing in learning. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 40(2), 147-161. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ488564
- Kong, C.-k., & Hau, K.-t. (1996). Students' achievement goals and approaches to learning: the relationship between emphasis on self-improvement and thorough understanding. *Research in Education*, 55(1), 74-85. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177%2F003452379605500107</u>
- Koopman, M., Bakx, A., & Beijaard, D. (2014). Students' goal orientations and learning strategies in a powerful learning environment: A case study. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 43, 186-196. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2014.07.003
- Lai, P., & Biggs, J. (1994). Who benefits from mastery learning? Contemporary Educational Psychology, 19(1), 13-23. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1006/ceps.1994.1002</u>

- Lau, S., Liem, A. D., & Nie, Y. (2008). Task- and self-related pathways to deep learning: The mediating role of achievement goals, classroom attentiveness, and group participation. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 78(4), 639-662. <u>https://doi.org/10.1348/000709907X270261</u>
- Lee, M.-H., Johanson, R. E., & Tsai, C. C. (2008). Exploring Tiwanese high school students' conceptions of and approaches to learning science through a structural equation modeling analysis. *Science Education*, 92(2), 191-220. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/sce.20245</u>
- Li, M., Zheng, C., Liang, J. C., Zhang, Y., & Tsai, C. C. (2018). Conceptions, self-Regulation, and strategies of learning science among chinese high school students. International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education, 16(1), 69-87. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10763-016-9766-2</u>
- Liem, G. A. D., Ginns, P., Martin, A. J., Stone, B., & Herrett, M. (2012). Personal best goals and academic and social functioning: A longitudinal perspective. *Learning and Instruction*, 22(3), 222-230. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2011.11.003
- Lingvay, M., Timofte, R. S., Ciascai, L., & Predescu, C. (2015). A comparative study of learning strategies used by Romanian and Hungarian preuniversity students in science learning. *Acta Didactica Napocensia*, 8(4), 47-54. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1092630</u>
- Luby, A. (2014). First footing inter-faith dialogue. Educational Action Research, 22(1), 57-71. https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2013.854176
- Matos, L., Lens, W., Vansteenkiste, M., & Mouratidis, A. (2017). Optimal motivation in Peruvian high schools: Should learners pursue and teachers promote mastery goals, performance-approach goals or both? *Learning and Individual Differences*, 55, 87-96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2017.02.003
- Mazlum, F., Cheraghi, F., & Dasta, M. (2015). English teachers' self-efficacy beliefs and students learning approaches: The role of classroom structure perception. International Journal of Educational Psychology, 4(3), 305-328. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ111644</u>
- McClintic-Gilbert, M. S., Henderlong Corpus, J., Wormington, S. V., & Haimovitz, K. (2013). The relationships among middle school students' motivational orientations, learning strategies, and academic achievement. *Middle Grades Research Journal*, 8(1), 1-12. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1146268</u>
- McInerney, D. M., Cheng, R. W.-y., Mok, M. M. C., & Lam, A. K. H. (2012). Academic self-concept and learning strategies: Direction of effect on student academic achievement. *Journal of Advanced Academics*, 23(3), 249-269. https://doi.org/10.1177/1932202X12451020
- Munowenyu, E. (2007). Assessing the quality of essays using the SOLO taxonomy: Effects of field and classroom-based experiences by "A" level geography students. International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education, 16(1), 21-43. <u>https://doi.org/10.2167/irg204.0</u>
- Murayama, K., Pekrun, R., Lichtenfeld, S., & vom Hofe, R. (2013). Predicting long-term growth in students' mathematics achievement: The unique contributions of motivation and cognitive strategies. *Child Development*, 84(4), 1475-1490. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12036</u>
- Nehring, J. H., & Szczesiul, S. (2015). Redefining high performance in Northern Ireland: Deeper learning and twenty-first century skills meet high stakes accountability. Journal of Educational Change, 16(3), 327-348. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10833-015-9250-8</u>
- Norris, E., De Aguiar Chaves, T., & Dunsmuir, S. (2015). Effects of a six-session introductory psychology programme on Year 9 pupils' interest in psychology and approaches to learning. *Psychology Teaching Review*, 21(1), 3-12. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?q=psychology&pg=8&id=EJ1146521</u>
- Parker, W. C., Lo, J., Yeo, A. J., Valencia, S. W., Nguyen, D., Abbott, R. D., Nolen, S. B., Bransford, J. D., & Vye, N. J. (2013). Beyond breadth-speed-test: Toward deeper knowing and engagement in an advanced placement course. *American Educational Research Journal*, 50(6), 1424-1459. <u>https://doi.org/10.3102/0002831213504237</u>
- Parker, W. C., Mosborg, S., Bransford, J., Vye, N., Wilkerson, J., & Abbott, R. (2011). Rethinking advanced high school coursework: Tackling the depth/breadth tension in the AP US Government and Golitics course. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 43(4), 533-559. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2011.584561</u>
- Parker, W. C., Valencia, S. W., & Lo, J. C. (2017). Teaching for deeper political learning: a design experiment. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 1-26. https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2017.1343386
- Phan, H. P., & Ngu, B. (2015). Introducing the concept of optimized functioning in academic contexts: Establishing evidence for further consideration. *International Journal of Pedagogy and Curriculum*, 22(4), 1-19. <u>https://doi.org/10.18848/2327-7963/CGP/v22i04/48875</u>
- Pugh, K. J., Koskey, K. L. K., & Linnenbrink-Garcia, L. (2014). High school biology students transfer of the concept of natural selection: A mixed-methods approach. Journal of Biological Education, 48(1), 23-33. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/00219266.2013.801873</u>
- Rao, Z., Gu, P. Y., Zhang, L. J., & Hu, G. (2007). Reading strategies and approaches to learning of bilingual primary school pupils. *Language Awareness*, 16(4), 243-262. http://dx.doi.org/10.2167/la423.0

- Rozendaal, J. S., Minnaert, A., & Boekaerts, M. (2001). Motivation and self-regulated learning in secondary vocational education: Information-processing type and gender differences. *Learning and Individual Differences*, 13(4), 273-289. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S1041-6080(03)00016-5</u>
- Schiff, R., & Vakil, E. (2014). Age differences in cognitive skill learning, retention and transfer: The case of the tower of hanoi puzzle. *Learning and Individual Differences,* 39, 164-171. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2015.03.010</u>
- Şen, Ş. (2016). Modeling the structural relations among learning strategies, self-efficacy beliefs, and effort regulation. Problems of Education in the 21st Century, 71, 62-72. <u>http://www.scientiasocialis.lt/pec/node/1017</u>
- Smith, T. W., & Colby, S. A. (2007). Teaching for deep learning. *Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas, 80*(5), 205-210. http://heldref.metapress.com/openurl.asp?genre=article&id=doi:10.3200/TCHS.80.5.205-210
- van Aalst, J., Hing, F. W., May, L. S., & Yan, W. P. (2007). Exploring information literacy in secondary schools in Hong Kong: A case study. *Library & Information Science Research*, 29(4), 533-552. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lisr.2007.06.004
- Vos, N., Van Der Meijden, H., & Denessen, E. (2011). Effects of constructing versus playing an educational game on student motivation and deep learning strategy use. *Computers and Education, 56*(1), 127-137. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2010.08.013</u>
- Watkins, D., & Ismail, M. (1994). Is the asian learner a rote learner? A Malaysian perspective. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 19(4), 483-488. https://doi.org/10.1006/ceps.1994.1035
- Watkins, D., McInerney, D., Akande, A., & Lee, C. (2003). An investigation of ethnic differences in the motivation and strategies for learning of students in desegregated South African schools. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 34(2), 189-194. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0022022102250563</u>
- Wishart, J., & Triggs, P. (2010). MuseumScouts: Exploring how schools, museums and interactive technologies can work together to support learning. *Computers & Education, 54*(3), 669-678. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2009.08.034</u>
- Yerdelen-Damar, S., & Aydin, S. (2015). Relations of approaches to learning with perceptions of learning environment and goal orientations. *Education and Science*, 40(179), 269-293. <u>https://doi.org/10.15390/EB.2015.4332</u>
- Yerdelen-Damar, S., & Elby, A. (2016). Sophisticated epistemologies of physics versus high-stakes tests: How do elite high school students respond to competing influences about how to learn physics? *Physical Review Physics Education Research*, *12*(1), Article 010118. <u>https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevPhysEducRes.12.010118</u>
- Zhang, J., & Ziegler, M. (2016). How do the big five influence scholastic performance? A big five-narrow traits model or a double mediation model. *Learning and Individual Differences, 50,* 93-102. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2016.07.011</u>
- Zheng, L., Dong, Y., Huang, R., Chang, C. Y., & Bhagat, K. K. (2017). Investigating the interrelationships among conceptions of, approaches to, and self-efficacy in learning science. *International Journal of Science Education*, 1-20. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/09500693.2017.1402142</u>
- Önen, E. (2015). Connections between modes of thinking and learning approaches: Implications for education and research. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 4(1), 84-96. https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1075169